

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

In Appreciation	vii
Table of Contents	ix
Table of Cases	xix
Books by Joseph E. Magnet	xxiv
Acknowledgments	xxv

PART I - STRUCTURE OF CANADIAN GOVERNMENT

1. SOURCES OF CONSTITUTIONAL LAW	1
(a) Constitutional Theory, Constitutional Principle,	
Constitutional Law	1
Research Note - The Sources of Constitutional Law	1
Reference Re Provincial Judges	7
Reference Re Secession of Quebec	24
Beverly McLachlin, Unwritten Constitutional Principles:	
What is Going On?	47
Research Note - R. v. Powley	50
(b) Constitutional Convention	50
Research Note - Constitutional Conventions	50
Reference Re Amendment of the Constitution of Can.	
(Nos. 1, 2 and 3) "The Patriation Reference"	53
Osborne v. Canada (Treasury Board)	65
2. FEDERALISM	67
(a) General Characteristics and Trends	69
Keith S. Rosenn, "Federalism in the Americas in	
Comparative Perspective"	69
Daniel J. Elazar, "Federalism and the Way to Peace"	71
Ronald L. Watts, "Comparing Federal Systems"	76
(b) Characteristics of Canadian Federalism	78
D.V. Smiley, "The Federal Condition in Canada"	78
Albert Breton, "Supplementary Statement"	
- In Royal Commission On the Economic Union	
and Development Prospects for Canada Report	80
John A. Macdonald on The Federal System	89
Research Note - Federalism Cases	90
Reference Re Amendment of the Constitution of Can.	
(Nos. 1, 2 and 3) "The Patriation Reference"	91

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(c) Federalism, Confederalism, and Supra-National Political Association	98
(i) Quebec's Grievances and Proposals	98
Research Note - Quebec's Grievances and Proposals	98
Position of the Partis Québécois on the Separatist Movement Today	103
Comité National du Oui, "To Build a Quebec Society: Our Hearts Into Work"	104
(ii) Federalism and its Alternatives	107
Peter Leslie, "The Maastricht Model: A Canadian Perspective On the European Union"	107
Ronald L. Watts, "Comparing Federal Systems"	110
Lucien Bouchard, "Why we are Sovereignists"	111
Research Note - Nation Resolution	112
Thomas M. Franck, "Why Federations Fail"	115
3. DEVICES FOR INTERGOVERNMENTAL COOPERATION IN A FEDERAL STATE	116
(a) General	116
Research Note - Federalism and Flexibility	116
Herperger, "Distribution of Powers and Functions in Federal Systems"	117
(b) Delegation	120
(i) General	120
G.V. La Forest, "Delegation of Legislative Power in Canada" ..	120
(ii) Administrative Delegation	126
Hodge v. R.	126
Research Note - Administrative Delegation	128
(iii) Interlegislative Delegation	131
A.G.N.S. v. A.G. Can.	131
R. v. Furtney	135
B.C. (Milk Board) v. Grisnich	138
(c) Executive Federalism	140
Research Note - Democratic Deficit	140
(d) Intergovernmental Agreements	142
Reference Re Canada Assistance Plan	142
Research Note - Intergovernmental Agreements	143

TABLE OF CONTENTS

4. KEY CONCEPTS IN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW	148
(a) Supremacy of the Constitution	148
Constitution Act, 1982, s. 52(1)	148
Research Note: Laws Inconsistent with the Constitution	148
Law Society of Upper Canada v. Skapinker	150
Reference Re Manitoba Language Rights	152
(b) The Rule of Law	155
Research Note - Overview of the Rule of Law	155
Chief Justice Beverley McLachlin, “Rules and Discretion in the Governance of Canada”	164
Rodger Beehler, “Waiting for the Rule of Law”	165
Reference Re Manitoba Language Rights	167
B.C. v. Imperial Tobacco	174
(c) Limited Authority of Government Officials	180
Roncarelli v. Duplessis	180
R. v. Catagas	184
(d) Separation of Powers	186
Research Note - The Separation of Powers	186
R. v. Power	200
Doucet-Boudreau v. Nova Scotia	206
Research Note - Crown Privilege and the Separation of Powers	213
5. JUDICIAL POWER	215
(a) Protected Status of Constitutional Review	215
Amax Potash Ltd. v. Sask.	215
Kingstreet Investments Ltd. v. New Brunswick	216
(b) Reference Cases	219
Research Note - Reference Procedure	219
Reference Re Secession of Quebec	221
Reference Re Same Sex Marriage	224
(c) Interpretation of Section 96	227
Constitution Act, 1867, s. 96	227
Reference Re Residential Tenancies Act	227
Nova Scotia (A.G.) v. Sobeys’ Stores Ltd.	234
McEvoy v. A.G. N.B. and A.G. Can.	239
MacMillan Bloedel Ltd. v. Simpson	241
(d) Judicial Independence	250
Shetreet, “Judicial Independence: New Conceptual Dimensions and Contemporary Challenges”	250
Research Note - Independence of the Judiciary	255
Reference Re Provincial Judges (No. 2)	256
Re Application under s. 83.28 of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	263

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART II – TECHNIQUES OF FEDERALISM REVIEW

1. MATTERS COMING WITHIN CLASSES OF SUBJECTS	275
(a) General	275
W.R. Lederman, “The Balanced Interpretation of the Federal Distribution of Legislative Powers in Canada”	275
Strayer, “The Canadian Constitution and the Courts”	279
Richard E. Simeon, “Criteria for Choice in Federal Systems” ..	280
(b) Judicial Tools for Resolving Federalism Disputes	284
(i) “In Relation to” and “Ancillary” Doctrines	284
Constitution Act, 1867 (U.K.), ss. 91, 92	284
Research Note - Pith and Substance	285
Walter v. A.G. Alta.; Fletcher v. A.G. Alta.	287
Munro v. Nat. Capital Comm.	291
R. v. Morgentaler [1993]	294
Ward v. Canada	301
Note: Firearms Reference	307
(ii) “Necessarily Incidental” Doctrine, “Rational Functional Connection” Test	307
General Motors v. City National Leasing	307
Kitkatla Band v. B.C.	310
Canadian Western Bank v. Alberta	319
2. PARAMOUNTCY	324
(a) Double Aspect Theory	324
Lederman, “The Concurrent Operation of Federal and Provincial Laws in Canada”	324
Law Society of British Columbia v. Mangat	332
(b) Duplication	338
Multiple Access Ltd. v. McCutcheon	338
R. v. Chiasson	343
(c) Contradiction	349
Ross v. Reg. of Motor Vehicles	349
Bank of Montreal v. Hall	353
Rothman’s Benson & Hedges v. Saskatchewan	356
Canadian Western Bank v. Alberta	360
3. INTERJURISDICTIONAL IMMUNITY	365
Research Note - Paramountcy and Interjurisdictional Immunity	365
Canadian Western Bank v. Alberta	368
A.-G. B.C. v. Lafarge Canada Inc.	378

PART III – DIVISION OF LEGISLATIVE POWERS

1. PROPERTY AND CIVIL RIGHTS IN THE PROVINCE	389
(a) Sections 92(13) and 92(16)	389
McConnell, “Commentary on the British North America Act”	389
Research Note - Section 92(16) - The Provincial Residuary Clause?	393
Lysyk, “Constitutional Reform and the Introductory Clause of Section 91: Residual and Emergency Law-Making Authority”	393
(b) Matters ‘Coming Within’ Section 92(13)	395
Citizens Ins. Co. v. Parsons; Queen Ins. Co. v. Parsons	395
Bedard v. Dawson	397
McNeil v. N.S. Bd. of Censors	399
Research Note: Rio Hotel Ltd. v. N.B.(Liquor Licensing Bd.) and Local Morality	404
A.G. Que. v. Kellogg’s Co.	405
(c) The Territorial Limit: “Within the Province”	407
Royal Bank v. R.	407
Ladore v. Bennett	409
Interprovincial Co-op Ltd. v. R.	411
Research Note - The Treatment of Pollution and Crown Zellerbach	423
Churchill Falls (Lab.) Corp. v. A.G. Nfld.	423
Hunt v. T&N, PLC	428
Muscutt v. Courcelles	434
ICBC v. Unifund Assurance	444
B.C. v. Imperial Tobacco	452
2. RESIDUARY AND EMERGENCY POWERS	458
(a) General	458
Lysyk, “Constitutional Reform and the Introductory Clause of Section 91: Residual and Emergency Law-Making Authority”	458
Note: Newness	463
(b) The Residuary Power	464
(i) Early Development	464
Russell v. R.	464
A.G. Ont. v. A.G. Can.	467
(ii) Matters “Not Coming Within” Section 92	470
A.G. Ont. v. Canada Temperance	470
Research Note - Matters of National Concern	473
Reference Re Anti-Inflation Act	474

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(iii) Matters of “National Concern”	485
R. v. Crown Zellerbach Can. Ltd.	485
Research Note - The Future of the National Concern Doctrine	499
Note: Malmo-Levine v. The Queen	505
(c) Emergency	505
Re Board of Commerce Act, 1919, and Combines and Fair Prices Act, 1919	505
Fort Francis Pulp & Power Co. v. Man. Free Press Co.	507
Reference Re Anti-Inflation Act	511
3. TRADE AND COMMERCE	518
(a) General	518
Brian Morgan, “The Trade and Commerce Power” (2006)	518
(b) Intraprovincial Trade and Commerce	533
(i) Provincial Competence “in relation to”	533
Citizens Ins. Co. v. Parsons; Queen Ins. Co. v. Parsons	533
Home Oil Distributors Ltd. v. A.G.B.C.	534
Reference Re Farm Products Marketing Act	537
Reference Re Agricultural Products Marketing Act	545
Fédération des producteurs de volailles du Québec v. Pelland	549
(ii) Ancillary Federal Competence	557
R. v. Eastern Terminal Elevator Co.	557
Reference Re Natural Products Marketing Act, 1934	559
(c) Interprovincial Trade and Commerce	563
(i) Federal Competence “in relation to”	563
Caloil Inc. v. A.G. Can. (No. 2)	563
(ii) Ancillary Provincial Competence	565
A.G. Man v. Man. Egg & Poultry Assn.	565
Burns Foods Ltd. v. A.G. Man.	572
Canadian Industrial Gas & Oil Ltd. v. Sask.	575
Research Note - The Aftermath of CIGOL	581
(d) General Trade and Commerce Affecting The Dominion	582
Labatt’s Breweries of Can. Ltd. v. A.G. Can.	582
A.G. Can. v. C.N. Transport Ltd.; A.G. Can. v. C.P. Transport Co.	587
Research Note - Regulatory Schemes and the Trade & Commerce Power	591
MacDonald v. Vapour Can. Ltd.	593
General Motors of Canada Ltd. v. City National Leasing	598
Kirkbi v. Ritvik Holdings	607

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(e) The National Market and the Division of Powers	613
Research Note - The Increased Importance of the National Market	613
K. Swinton, "Courting Our Way to Economic Integration: Judicial Review and the Economic Union"	617
4. TAXATION AND SPENDING POWERS	624
(a) Overview	624
Magnet, "The Constitutional Distribution of Taxation Powers in Canada"	624
Research Note - Analysing the Modern Taxing Power	626
(b) Is it a Tax?	629
Westbank First Nation v. B.C. Hydro and Power Authority ..	629
(c) Direct Taxation vs. Indirect Taxation	635
Magnet, "The Constitutional Distribution of Taxation Powers in Canada"	635
Canadian Industrial Gas & Oil Ltd. v. Sask.	637
Reference Re Quebec G.S.T.	650
(d) Licenses and "Regulatory Charges"	656
Magnet, "The Constitutional Distribution of Taxation Powers in Canada"	656
Allard Contractors v. Coquitlam	660
Ontario Home Builders Association v. York Region Bd. of Education	663
(e) Section 121	667
Gold Seal Ltd. v. Dom. Express Co.	667
Murphy v. C.P.R.	668
(f) Section 125	672
Reference Re Tax Proposed by Parliament of Can. on Exported Natural Gas	672
Reference Re G.S.T.	684
(g) The Spending Power	686
Magnet, "The Constitutional Distribution of Taxation Powers in Canada"	686
Research Note - The Spending Power and Attempts to Limit it	689
Winterhaven Stables Ltd. v. Canada (Attorney General)	691
Research Note - Cuts to the Canada Assistance Plan	694

TABLE OF CONTENTS

5. CRIMINAL LAW	695
(a) General	695
Constitution Act, 1867, ss. 91, 92	695
Research Note - The Criminal Law Power	696
(b) Federal Jurisdiction	700
Proprietary Articles Trade Assn. v. A.G. Can. (Re Combines Investigation Act and s. 498 Criminal Code)	700
Reference Re s. 5(a) of the Dairy Industry Act (Margarine Case)	702
Morgentaler v. The Queen	704
Note: R. v. Morgentaler (1993)	707
RJR MacDonald Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General)	707
Reference Re Firearms Act (Can.)	715
R. v. Malmo Levine	725
R. v. Demers	730
(c) Provincial Jurisdiction	739
(i) Regulatory Offences	739
N.S. Bd. of Censors v. McNeil	739
Rio Hotel Ltd. v. Liquor Licensing Bd.	743
A.G. Can v. Montreal	746
Allan Singer Ltd. v. A.G. Que.	751
Westendorp v. R.	753
Research Note - Provincial Regulatory "Crimes"	756
(ii) Administration of Justice in the Province: s. 92(14)	758
Di Iorio v. Montreal Jail Warden	758
A.G. Que. v. A.G. Can.	764
Starr v. Houlden	768
Canadian Red Cross et al. v. Krever	774
A.G. Can. v. C.N. Tpt. Ltd.; A.G. Can. v. C.P. Tpt. Co.	782
6. TRANSPORTATION AND COMMUNICATION	790
(a) General	790
Elizabeth F. Judge, The Internet and the Division of Powers ..	790
Constitution Act, 1867, ss. 91, 92	796
(b) Federal Jurisdiction	797
(i) Introduction	797
A.G. Ont. v. Winner	797
Research Note - Interprovincial Undertakings in Transportation and Communications	804

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(ii) Basis of Federal Jurisdiction: “Interprovincial Workings and Undertakings”	814
Toronto v. Bell Telephone	814
Alberta Government Telephones v. C.R.T.C.	817
S.M.T. (Eastern) Ltd. v. Ruch	820
Westcoast Energy Inc. v. Canada (National Energy Board)	822
(iii) Scope of Federal Jurisdiction	831
Capital Cities Communications Inc. v. C.R.T.C.	831
Dionne v. Public Services Bd. (Que.)	835
(c) Provincial Power to Interfere Collaterally	838
Bell Canada v. Quebec (La Commission de la Santé et de la Sécurité Du Travail)	838
C.N.R. v. Clark	847
7. TREATY-MAKING POWER	850
Research Note - The Labour Conventions Case	850
Melanie Mallet, A Primer on Treaty Making and Treaty Implementation in Canada (Original Contribution)	853
 PART IV - ABORIGINAL PEOPLES	
1. INTRODUCTION	859
Constitution Acts, 1867, 1982	859
The Royal Proclamation, 1763	860
First Nations in Canada	
Dept. of Indian Affairs and Northern Development (1997)	862
2. DISTRIBUTION OF LEGISLATIVE POWERS	872
(a) Federal Legislative Power	872
R. v. Morris	872
(b) Fiduciary Nature of the Crown’s Authority	877
Research Note - Fiduciary Duty	877
Guerin v. The Queen	883
Wewaykum Indian Band v. Canada	890
(c) The Honour of the Crown	899
Research Note - Haida Nation v. B.C.	899
Mikisew Cree First Nation v. Canada	904
3. SECTION 35	914
(a) General Concepts	914
R. v. Sparrow	914

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(b) Aboriginal Rights	926
Research Note - Aboriginal Rights	926
R. v. Van der Peet	931
R. v. Powley	951
R. v. Sappier	957
Pape, "The s.35 Justification Test: The Developing Jurisprudence"	965
(c) Aboriginal Title	971
Delgamuukw v. British Columbia	971
R. v. Marshall; R. v. Bernard	987
(d) Treaty Rights	996
Research Note - Canada's Treaties with Aboriginal People ..	996
R. v. Badger	1003
Marshall v. The Queen	1015
Marshall v. The Queen Marshall (II)	1022
 PART V: SOME PROBLEMS OF CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES	
1. READING DOWN	1031
Research Note - The Presumption of Constitutionality	1031
2. SEVERABILITY	1033
Reference Re Alta. Bill of Rights Act; A.G. Alta. v. A.G. Can.;	
A.G. Can. v. A.G. Alta.	1033
Research Note - Severability	1035
3. READING IN AND DELAYED REMEDIES	1037
Schachter v. Canada	1037
Vriend v. Alberta	1049
Corbiere v. Canada (Minister of Indian and Northern Affairs)	1054
M. v. H.	1058
 APPENDIX 1	
The Constitution Act, 1867	A1-1
APPENDIX 2	
Constitution Act, 1982	A2-1